

# Montana State Legislature

2011 Session

**Exhibit**

4

**This exhibit is a booklet which can not be scanned, therefore only the front cover/table of content and 10 pages have been scanned to aid in your research.**

**The original exhibits are on file at the Montana Historical Society and may be viewed there.**

**Montana Historical  
Society Archives  
225 N. Roberts  
Helena MT 59620-1201  
2011 Legislative Scanner Susie Hamilton**

# THE NEW POLITICS OF JUDICIAL ELECTIONS 2000-2

SENATE JUDICIAL

EXHIBIT NO. 4

DATE 1/27/11

FILE NO. SB 175

## DECADE OF CHANGE

*by*

**James Sample**

Hofstra University School of Law

**Adam Skaggs and Jonathan Blitzer**

Brennan Center for Justice at NYU School of Law

**Linda Casey**

National Institute on Money in State Politics

**Charles Hall, Editor**

Justice at Stake Campaign

**With a foreword from  
Justice Sandra Day O'Connor**

BRENNAN  
CENTER  
FOR JUSTICE

at New York University School of Law

  
**Justice at Stake**  
campaign

NATIONAL  
INSTITUTE ON  
**MONEY IN  
STATE  
POLITICS**  


# Table of Contents

<b>List of Charts and Figures</b>	<b>page vi</b>
<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>page 1</b>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>The Money Explosion</b>	<b>Page 5</b>
Rise of the Super Spenders	Page 9
The Threat to Justice	Page 9
How We Got Here	Page 14
Rise of the Super Spenders: Alabama	Page 15
Super Spenders in Other States	Page 16
Triumph of the Super Spenders: Illinois	Page 16
Money: Focus on 2007-08	Page 17
Other States of Note in 2007-08	Page 21
2009 High Court Elections: Costly Trends Continue	Page 21
Chapter Notes	Page 23
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>Court TV: The Rise of Costly Attack Ads</b>	<b>Page 24</b>
Introduction: After the Flood	Page 24
Independent Ads Lead the Attack	Page 25
Party Ads Crucial in '08	Page 28
State in Focus: Michigan	Page 30
TV: Focus on 2008	Page 31
State in Focus: Wisconsin	Page 32
2007: TV Spending in an Off Year	Page 36
Chapter Notes	Page 37
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>Who Played? Who Won?</b>	<b>Page 38</b>
Nationalizing of Court Elections	Page 39
The Left: Organizing at the State Level	Page 41
The National Networks	Page 42
American Justice Partnership	Page 42
U.S. Chamber of Commerce Network	Page 43
American Tort Reform Association	Page 44
The Secret Money Players	Page 44
Democratic Judicial Campaign Committee	Page 44
State-Level Coalitions	Page 45
Texas Titans: Bob Perry and Fred Baron	Page 45
Focus on Alabama: Shell Game on the Left	Page 46

Michigan/Wisconsin: What's Behind the Curtain?	Page 48
Georgia: Here Today, Gone Tomorrow	Page 49
The Battle for America's Courts	Page 50
Quotes From the Decade	Page 52
Chapter Notes	Page 54

## Chapter 4

### **Litigation: The Battle Inside the Courtroom** **Page 55**

<i>Caperton v. Massey</i> : When Judges Must Step Aside	Page 55
Who Decides What Is Fair and Impartial?	Page 56
An Earlier Case of Election Bias?	Page 57
The Caperton Coalition: Diverse Groups Rally to Defend Impartial Justice	Page 58
Judicial Speech: How Far Can Candidates Go?	Page 61
Campaign Finance Returns to the High Court	Page 62
Balancing Two Constitutional Rights: Free Speech and Fair Trials	Page 64
Chapter Notes	Page 66

## Chapter 5

### **Public Takes Note, Decision-Makers Begin to Follow** **Page 67**

Recent Reform Efforts	Page 67
The Broader Reform Menu	Page 69
The Rise and Fall of Judicial Tampering by Ballot Measures	Page 71
The Media Take Note	Page 72
Judicial Appointments: The Emerging Battlefield	Page 73
U.S. Chamber of Commerce and Merit Selection	Page 74
The Voters Weigh In	Page 74
Debate in the Business Sector	Page 75
Hanging a 'For Sale' Sign Over the Judiciary	Page 76
Chapter Notes	Page 76

## Appendices

Appendix 1: State Profiles, 2000–2009	Page 78
Appendix 2: Supreme Court TV Advertisements 2008	Page 86
Appendix 3: Facts About State Court Election and Appointment Systems	Page 99
Appendix 4: About the Authors	Page 100

## **Photo Sources** **Page 102**

## **Index** **Page 104**

# List of Charts and Figures

## Chapter 1

### The Money Explosion

1. State Supreme Court Fundraising by Biennium	Page 5
2. Total Supreme Court Fundraising Ranked by State, 2000–2009	Page 6
3. Contributions by Sector, 2000–2009 High Court Elections	Page 8
4. Super Spenders and What They Spent	Page 10
5. Total Spending for Top 10 States, 2000–2009 High Court Elections	Page 12
6. Top U.S. Super Spenders, 2000–2009 High Court Elections	Page 13
7. Supreme Court Fundraising: Partisan, Nonpartisan and Retention Elections	Page 14
8. Total Supreme Court Spending: Top 10 States, 2007–08	Page 17
9. Top 10 Supreme Court Super Spenders, 2007–08	Page 18
10. Contributions by Sector, 2007–08	Page 19
11. Supreme Court Fundraising by Candidates on Ballot, 2007–08	Page 20

## Chapter 2

### Court TV: The Rise of Costly Attack Ads

12. Number of TV Ad Airings by Year, 2000–2009 High Court Elections	Page 25
13. Total Spending on TV Ads, 2000–09	Page 26
14. Ohio 2000 Ad: Is Justice for Sale?	Page 26
15. High Court Election TV Spending, 2000–2009	Page 27
16. Top 12 TV Ad Spenders, 2000–2009 High Court Elections	Page 28
17. Greater Wisconsin Committee, TV Ad from 2008	Page 29
18. TV Spending, 2008 High Court Elections	Page 29
19. The Sleeping Judge: Democratic Ad Slams Michigan Chief Justice	Page 30
20. Sponsors and Tone, 2008 High Court Election Ads	Page 31
21. 2008 Anti-Butler Ad Triggered Questions on Truth, Race	Page 33
22. Alabama 2008: Ad Ties Candidate to Special Interests	Page 34
23. Michigan 2008: Challenger Assailed as Soft on Terrorism	Page 35
24. TV Spending, 2007 High Court Elections	Page 36
25. TV Spending in Off-Year High Court Elections, Pennsylvania and Wisconsin	Page 36

### **Chapter 3**

#### **Who Played? Who Won?**

26. Washington 2006: National Groups Finance Attack Ads in State Race	Page 38
27. Top Supreme Court Spenders, 2000–09 and 2007–08	Page 40
28. PACs Used by Beasley Allen to Mask High Court Donations	Page 47
29. Map: The Battle for America's Courts	Page 50

### **Chapter 4**

#### **The Battle Inside the Courtroom**

30. <i>New York Times</i> Caperton Headline	Page 55
31. Chronology of <i>Avery v. State Farm</i> Controversy	Page 57
32. <i>Washington Post</i> Citizens United Headline	Page 63

### **Chapter 5**

#### **Public Takes Note, Decision-Makers Begin to Follow**

33. What the Public and Business Leaders Think	Page 68
34. South Dakota Amendment E Ad	Page 71
35. Ad for Greene County Nonpartisan Court Plan	Page 73
36. Ad against Greene County Nonpartisan Court Plan	Page 73